Race and the Hereford *Mappa Mundi*

Constructed in a period of Jewish expulsion and rebirth of climatic theory, the Hereford World map provides an alternative lens to discover the racialised attitudes in Hereford, England and Latin Christendom around 1300. Indeed, despite the ambiguity concerning who, when and why it was made, as the largest surviving *Mappa Mundi* the Hereford map displays layers of biblical, ancient and political knowledge through its often moralising iconography. Whilst this ambiguity reduces the conclusive nature of interpretations, the map's significance lies in the variety of angles it can be approached from, including gender, monstrosity and racial studies. Therefore, this essay will use the Hereford map as a case study in order to examine thirteenth century Latin Christian attitudes towards race in light of critical race scholars such as Heng, who highlighted the importance of 'cartographic' race.[1] This essay will argue that thirteenth century Latin Christian attitudes towards race are evident on the Hereford map to a greater extent through more embodied representations of race and yet, less evident in its portrayal of epidermal race. This will be demonstrated by an analysis of the depiction of religion, monstrosity, climate and epidermal race on the Hereford map. Overall, the treatment of the Jews on the Hereford map best reflects Latin Christian attitudes towards race because it reflects the prevalence of an ethno-racial hierarchy maintained by state and biblical legislation that challenged the authenticity of Jewish conversion.

The intensity of twenty-first century debate that this essay will engage with creates the need for a brief layout of three key terms. First, there is discord among today's scholars over whether the terms 'race' or 'ethnicity' is best suited when analysing medieval sources, especially when translating *gens*. Indeed, Bartlett treats race and ethnicity synonymously in stark contrast to Heng's convincing argument that modern terms such as race can be used due to the 'dynamic oscillations' of 'modernity'.[2] Therefore, in line with Mittman's compelling argument on the importance of actively

[1] Geraldine Heng, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 2018), p. 33.
[2] Robert Bartlett, 'Medieval and Modern concepts of Race and Ethnicity', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 31:1(2001), pp. 41-42: Heng, *The Invention of Race*, p. 21.

pursuing an 'anti-racist' viewpoint, this essay will endeavour to use the term race, if only to expose the dangers of scholarly silence in racial studies.[3] Second, this essay will use the collective term 'marvellous peoples' when referring to the peoples predominantly found on the southern edge and round the margins of the Ecumene. Indeed, Mittman convincingly highlights the implication that the term 'monstrous races' normalises Latin Christendom as the opposite of monstrosity.[4] This binary suggests a problematic 'Them vs. Us' relationship that is quickly challenged by the presence of human physiology in the monsters and the internal divisions within Latin Christendom. Third, it must be noted that the depiction of Jews on the Exodus scene tell us more about Christians than about Jews. Therefore, this essay will use Heng's definition of race as social construct used to differentiate peoples indefinitely based on both embodied forms of race, such as religion, and also bodily representations of race, such as skin colour.[5] This essay will argue that the Hereford map is a prime example of embodied rather than bodily representations of race because medieval attitudes towards race are best demonstrated through religion and not through skin colour.

The Hereford World map's depiction of idol worshipping Jews within the Exodus scene appears to reflect thirteenth century racialised attitudes, namely Edward I's 1290 expulsion of England's Jews, and this is highlighted in two key examples. First, Strickland convincingly argues that the Exodus scene served as an 'ex post facto' justification of the 1290 Jewish expulsion as highlighted by the sudden switch between the biblical label 'Israelites' to the thirteenth century term 'Judei' that accompanies the idol worshipping Jews.[6] The swapped legends highlight the dual biblical and contemporary importance of Jews and yet, their positioning portrays them as temporally and geographically dissociated from England, thus referencing the Jewish expulsion. This indicates that

[3] Asa Simon Mittman, 'Anti-Race? The Need for Colour-Sightedness in Medieval and Renaissance Studies,' in Kim Coles and Dorothy Kim (eds.), A *Cultural History of Race in the Renaissance and Early Modern Age*, (London, upcoming 2021), p. 182.
[4] Asa Mittman, 'Are the 'monstrous races' races?', *Postmedieval*, 6:1 (2015), pp. 47-48.
[5] Heng, *The Invention of Race*, p. 27; Dorothy Kim, ' Introduction to literature compass special cluster: Critical race and the Middle Ages'*, Literature Compass*. 16:9 (2019), p.7.
[6] Debra Strickland, 'Edward I, Exodus, and England on the Hereford World Map', *Speculum*, 93:2 (2018), pp. 420-429.

England's figurative distance from the Exodus scene combined political policy onto biblical iconography and thus, significantly reflects an oppressive and heavily prejudiced attitude towards England's Jews. Second, the pejorative comparison between the prayer of the Jewish idol worshippers and St. Augustine further highlights the map's attempt to justify the Jewish expulsion. Indeed, although both the idol worshippers and St. Augustine are depicted praying on the same vertical plane, St. Augustine's placement means he is on a diagonal trajectory towards the saved compared to the idol worshippers, as argued by Mittman, who are on a diagonal towards hell.[7] This disparity indicates that salvation was dependent upon correct practices and thus, it could be speculated that the clerical figure shown leading the saved was St. Augustine not Thomas de Cantilupe. This is significant because Cantilupe had an arguably influential role over the Hereford map as demonstrated through its position on the pilgrimage route to Cantilupe's tomb in Hereford Cathedral. [8] Therefore, the comparison of the praying scenes suggests a hierarchical attitude towards religious ethno-racial identities and thus, further indicates that race was seen as embodied.

The inclusion of both the invisible and 'hyper-visible' idol worshipping Jew on the Hereford map demonstrates the contradictory nature of Latin Christian racial attitudes.[9] Indeed, Strickland's argument that the Tablets of Law iconography in the Exodus scene could potentially represent the Jewish badges decreed by the 1275 Statue of Jewry indicates thirteenth century awareness of an invisible Jew.[10] In comparison to the idol scene, the badge highlights the duality of Jewish identity as an invisible-visible enemy that needed a physical label and yet, was portrayed markedly differently in iconography. Therefore, the co-existence of the two tropes within inches of each other on the map demonstrates contradictory scholarly attitudes towards Jews. However, it must be noted that the Exodus scene makes up only a small proportion of the map and it has been argued that it would

[7] Asa Simon Mittman*, Cartographies of Exclusion: Christian Mapping of Jews in the age of the English Expulsion* (unpublished book draft on file with author).
[8] Thomas de Wesselow, ' Locating the Hereford Mappamundi', *Imago Mundi*, 65:2 (2013), p. 195.
[9] Mittman, *Cartographies of Exclusion.*
[10] Strickland, 'Edward I', p. 449.

have also been hung above eye level of passing pilgrims.[11] Thus, whilst many important arguments can be made about the scene, pilgrim interaction with these themes is far from certain. Nevertheless, although not explicitly referenced on the map, the emphasis on Jewish visibility might have been impacted by new types of scholastic debate such as the Quodlibetic question.[12] Jewish visibility in intellectual circles is aptly demonstrated by Biller's analysis of the late thirteenth century Parisian Quodlibet that reasoned that Jewish 'flux of blood' was caused by a 'melancholic' predisposition.[13] Therefore, the Quodlibet demonstrates the visibility of Jews in intellectual debate and although the map does not explicitly reference humoural theory, university educated onlookers may have connected medical explanations with Jewish visibility on the map. Overall, the map appears to reference thirteenth century tensions around Jewish visibility and thus, highlights contradictory medieval attitudes towards Judaism, an embodied representation of race.

Evidence of thirteenth century scepticism towards the authenticity of Jewish conversion and the coalescence of Islam and Judaism on the Hereford map reflect a fixed pejorative medieval attitude towards the fluidity of racial identity. Heng convincingly argues that Jewish conversion was often discredited and viewed as a 'hybrid racial identity' in line with existing state surveillance and oppression targeted towards Jews.[14] Indeed, the rejection of a prospective bishop by the bishop of Hereford, Thomas de Cantilupe, because "it was not proper that this convert and Jew should have power over Christians" suggests that conversion was viewed as superficial and tacitly highlights Christian fears of the repercussions of Jewish power.[15] Therefore, Cantilupe's connections with Hereford suggest that the map's fixed negative attitude towards Jews may have been influenced by localised anti-Semitic discourse. Furthermore, the possible translation of the incomplete legend 'mahu' above the calf idol as 'mahu[n]' referring to Muhammad, demonstrates the map's fusion of

[11] Marcia Kupfer, 'The Hereford Map (c. 1300)', in Dan Terkla and Nick Mellea (eds.), *A Companion to English Mappaemundi of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries* (Woodbridge, 2019), p. 239.
[12] Mittman, *Cartographies of Exclusion.*
[13] Peter Biller, 'Views of Jews from Paris around 1300: Christian or 'Scientific', *Studies in Church History, 29* (1992), p. 192.
[14] Heng, *The Invention of Race*, pp. 71-79.
[15] Heng, *The Invention of Race*, pp. 76-77.

Islam and Judaism as a collective religious 'other'.[16] Indeed, Strickland argues that the icon referenced both Jewish and Muslim idol worship and thus, this presents idol worship as a key indicator for heresy.[17] Also, the legend demonstrates the benefits of viewing medieval religions not in isolation, but in relation to one another and significantly highlights the absence of contemporary Jews or Muslims anywhere on the map.[18] Therefore, the absence of depictions of contemporary non-Christian religions within the Ecumene suggests that they were not perceived to have a place in the inhabited world. Overall, the map portrays contradictory yet fixed attitudes towards religious race because it suggests that whilst Jews were rarely allowed to be fully Christian, Latin Christians were prepared to share Jewish history with other religions.

The coalescence of monstrosity and Judaism on the Hereford map demonstrates an uncompromising medieval attitude that used monstrous iconography to perpetuate and justify the oppression of England's Jews. Indeed, Strickland convincingly argues that medieval depictions of monstrosity acted as a 'blueprint' for the treatment of marginalised non-Christian groups.[19] A key example of this on the map is the portrayal of the Himantopodes on all fours and orientated to emphasise an exaggerated nose and *'pileum cornutum'*, a typical Jewish conical hat.[20] The iconography illustrates the dehumanisation of Judaism to a monstrous level and therefore, potentially provided justification for Edward I's abusive attitude towards England's Jews. Moreover, parallels can be drawn between the depiction of the Himantopodes and the 'shape changing' Marsok found in close proximity to the Exodus scene because both symbolise the animalistic and irrationality of the Jews due to their links to monster tradition.[21] Thus, the active manipulation of monstrous tradition to further justify the expulsion of the Jews significantly indicates an uncompromising attitude towards race. Furthermore,

[16] Debra Higgs Strickland, *Saracens, Demons and Jews: Making Monsters in Medieval Art* (Princeton, 2003), p. 166.
[17] Strickland, *Saracens*, p. 166.
[18] Benjamin Braude,' The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographical Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods', *The William and Mary Quarterly,* 54:1 (1997), p. 105.
[19] Debra Strickland 'Monstrosity and Race in the Late Middle Ages', in Asa Simon Mittman and Peter Dendle (eds.), *The Ashgate Research Companion to Monsters and the Monstrous* (London, 2017), p. 366.
[20] Strickland, *Saracens*, p. 187.
[21] Scott Westrem, The *Hereford Map: A transcription and translation of the legends with commentary* (Turnhout, 2001), p. 115.

the rise of apocalypse manuscripts depicting the antichrist as a Jew in the thirteenth century reinforces anti-Semitic attitudes through Jewish associations with monstrosity.[22] Indeed, both the focal positioning of the last judgement at the top of the map and the eschatological connotations of 'passe avant' legend in the hunting scene, indicate the major influence of Millenarianism on the Hereford map.[23] The scene's depiction of a rider looking back at the world whilst being encouraged to 'go ahead' seemingly past the map's frontier emphasises the link between the Hereford Map and apocalyptic imagery.[24] Therefore, although the map does not explicitly link Judaism and the anti-Christ, medieval onlookers might have easily recognised the map's intolerant attitude towards the Jews and inferred the Jewish link with the last judgement. Overall, the Hereford map combines physical deformity with embodied Judaism to demonstrate an uncompromising medieval attitude towards race that manipulated pre-existing monstrous traditions to justify contemporary Jewish expulsion.

The ambiguous relationship between monstrosity and humanity on the Hereford map highlights the complex medieval attitudes towards the defining features of the 'human race'. This complexity is evident in Latin Christian attitudes towards genealogy and cultural customs. Indeed, Friedman successfully argues that Latin Christendom saw an increased interest in possible genealogical explanations of human differentiation and this is evident in the final stage of the Paradise expulsion scene on the Hereford map.[25] The depiction of Cynocephali, dogheaded people, immediately after Adam and Eve's expulsion perhaps refers to the popular theory that Adam's daughters were cursed after eating forbidden herbs and thus, gave birth to children with 'heads like those of dogs'.[26] Therefore, this indicates that unlike the lack of tolerance evident in the merging of monstrosity and Judaism, the map illustrates a flexible attitude towards the definition of the human race because

[22] Strickland 'Monstrosity and Race', *p. 383.*
[23] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 7.
[24] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, pp. 7-8.
[25] John Block Friedman, *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought* (New York, 2000), pp. 87-88.
[26] Kathryn Smits, ed. *Die frumittelhochdeutsche Wiener Genesis* (Berlin, 1972), 26.8, pp. 135-137, in Asa Simon Mittman, *Maps and Monsters in Medieval England* (New York, 2006), p. 93.

both human and monsters came from Adam. Furthermore, medieval attitudes towards cultural markers of monstrosity further challenge ideas of a simple 'Them vs. Us' interpretation of monstrosity. Indeed, the map clearly differentiates the Philli people from Latin Christians because their practice of testing their wives fidelity by 'exposing their newborns to serpents' deviated from established social norms of Latin Christendom.[27] However, the similarity between the Philli's bid for ethnic purity and Canon 68 of the 1215 Lateran council that marked off non-Christian peoples to stop 'prohibited intercourse' indicates that cultural customs could not easily differentiate between peoples.[28] Therefore, the shared concern for ethnic purity indicates the complexity of medieval attitudes to what defined the human race and instead highlights a spectrum of monstrosity.

The interplay between centre and periphery on the Hereford map demonstrates that medieval attitudes towards racial hierarchy did not equate marginality entirely with inferiority. Indeed, Mittman compellingly argues that England and Africa were fundamentally connected, as demonstrated in the portrayal of the marvellous peoples, England and Paradise all on the margin of the map. [29] England's marginality is further typified by Isidore of Seville's description of Britain as ' an island ... divided from the orb of the world', indicating that the portrayal of England at the edge of salvation was accepted at the time.[30] Therefore, England and the marvellous people of Africa are displayed as equidistant from the terrestrial and heavenly Jerusalem and this suggests that the Hereford map used other iconographical tools such as climate and religion to demonstrate racial hierarchy. Furthermore, Kupfer convincingly argues that the central Jerusalem iconography acted as both a 'centripetal' and 'centrifugal' force and thus, highlights the reciprocal relationship between centre and periphery.[31] Indeed, Brinken argues that it was only after the crusade of 1099 that

---

[27] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 381.
[28] 'Lateran IV: Canon 68 - on Jews', in H. Schroeder, *Disciplinary Decrees of the General Councils: Text, Translation and Commentary*, (St Louis, 1937), pp. 78-127.
[29] Asa Mittman, *Maps and Monsters in Medieval England* (New York, 2006), p. 42.
[30] Isidore of Seville, Etymologiarum Sive Originum Libri XX, vol. 2, ed. W .M. Lindsay (Oxford, 1966), 14.6.2, in Asa Simon Mittman, *Maps and Monsters in Medieval England* (New York, 2006),p. 17.
[31] Marcia Kupfer,' The Jerusalem Effect: Rethinking the Centre in Medieval World Maps', in Bianca Kühnel, Galit Noga-Banai, and Hanna Vorholt (eds.), *Visual Constructs of Jerusalem*(Turnhout, 2014), pp. 353-354.

Jerusalem appeared at the centre of medieval maps and in turn, the crucifixion scene resonated at a local level within Hereford due to similar iconography at St. Peter's church, Hereford.[32] This indicates that the centre could not be viewed in isolation of the periphery and thus, implies that medieval attitudes towards monstrosity and race did not follow a linear relationship.

The Hereford map also interacts with pioneering scholarly attitudes towards race and this is demonstrated in the elements of thirteenth century climate and humoural thought in the map's description of Gog and Magog's habitat. Indeed, Biller convincingly argues that the thirteenth century saw the rebirth of climatic theory through the translation of Greek and Arabic scholarship that was disseminated at a University and localised level through Mendicant friars' encyclopaedias.[33] Mendicant interaction with climate theory- the thought that topography and climate could impact moral and physical characteristics- is exemplified by Bartholomew the Englishman's argument that because 'the sonne abideth longe ouer the Affers' it led to 'wasten humours', 'crispe here' and 'cowardes of herte'.[34] This portrays the increased interest in scientific explanations of human characteristics and interestingly suggests that the period witnessed cross-discipline exchange of learned humoural, climatic and physiognomic knowledge. Moreover, the sermons were delivered to a lay audience and thus, this significantly highlights a potentially wider audience of scientific explanations of race than just the learned elite. The impact of scientific attitudes towards race on the Hereford map is evident in the legend describing the habitat of Gog and Magog. The description of an 'intolerable cold' and 'blasting wind' in a land filled with 'exceedingly savage people' potentially reflects climatic theory that the extreme north led to fiercesome characteristics.[35] Moreover, in line with the lay audience of mendicant friars, the inclusion of the vernacular name of the mountains,

[32] Anna-Dorothee von den Brinken,' Jerusalem on the Medieval Mappaemundi: a site both historical and eschatological', in P. D. A. Harvey (ed.) The Hereford World Map: Medieval World Maps and their context (London, 2006), p.373; Kupfer,' The Jerusalem Effect', p. 364.
[33] Peter Biller, 'Proto-racial thought in Medieval Science,' in Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac and Joseph Ziegler (eds.), *The origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 162-170.
[34] Bartholomaeus Anglicus, *De proprietatibus rerum* (Frankfurt, 1601) translated in Suzanne Conklin Akbari, *Idols in the East: European Representations of Islam and the Orient*, 1100-1450, (Ithaca, 2009), pp. 144-145.
[35] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 69.

'which the inhabitants call bizo' reflects a further link to the dissemination of learned theories.[36] Although the inhabitants may have been already 'savage' to start with, parallels can certainly be drawn between Bartholmaues's encyclopaedia and the Hereford map's legend.[37] Therefore, it can be concluded that the map successfully reflects scientific attitudes towards race that linked climate directly to embodied internal morals.

Moreover, the depiction of high levels of urbanisation in Europe relative to both Africa and Asia reflects medieval attitudes towards Europe's position as the optimal climate. Indeed, Weeda convincingly argues that from the twelfth century location of the 'most temperate region' transitioned away from Greece and Italy and towards northern Europe.[38] This ethnocentric view is demonstrated on the Hereford map through the predominance of towns and trading networks in Europe. Indeed, the portrayal of Paris as one of the largest architectural features on the map corresponds roughly with the establishment of the University of Paris, arguably the leading university in thirteenth century Latin Christendom.[39] Therefore, Europe is illustrated as both an intellectual centre and more significantly as the most habitable section of the map with the fewest strange monsters. Moreover, the map tacitly highlights a hierarchy of civilisation according to climate and reflects medieval attitudes that placed Europe as the perfect middle, a product of lawfulness, trade and learning.[40] Furthermore, Weeda successfully argues that medieval scholars manipulated Hippocratic climate theory to counter claims that Eastern and Southern people were naturally more intelligent due to their climate.[41] This concern is demonstrated in the Hereford map's depiction of the monstrous Hermaphrodite, identifiable as a Muslim through their turban and

[36] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 69.
[37] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 69.
[38] Claire Weeda, ' The Fixed and the Fluent: Geographical determinism, ethnicity and religion c. 1100–1300', in Rebecca Futo Kennedy and and Molly Jones-Lewis (eds.), *The Routledge Handbook of Identity and the Environment in the Classical and Medieval World* (London, 2016), p. 101.
[39] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 280.
[40] Claire Weeda, 'Laidlaw Research Project-Race and the Hereford map,' interviewed by Eva Macdonald, August 9 2021, audio, 11:00.
[41] Weeda, ' The Fixed and the Fluent', p. 101.

labelled as 'unnatural in many ways'.[42] This indicates that the map's author intentionally combined indicators of abnormality to suggest that although climate theory would naturally give the Hermaphrodite greater intelligence, their heretical religion, sexuality and monstrosity would counter it. Therefore, the map's 'othering' of the Hermaphrodite significantly indicates the limitations of climate theory as a device to be used only for Latin Christian benefit and thus, this indicates an ethnocentric attitude.

However, the map's T-O structure is better suited towards a Noachide division of the world in line with biblical and antiquity's interpretation of race and therefore is less suited to show climatic 'race making'. Indeed, Kupfer's analysis indicates that the structure of Macrobian maps, which divided the globe into frigid, torrid and temperate zones, best demonstrate cartographic representations of climate.[43] Moreover, Macrobian maps typically highlight the distinction between zones through the use of colour and this is demonstrated by the twelfth century Lambert map that used red pigment to denote the torrid region, parchment for temperate and blue pigment to illustrate the poles.[44] This indicates that pigmentation had scientific connotations and potentially highlights the wider dissemination of these ideas through iconographical formats to a non-literate audience. By contrast the pigmentation on the Hereford map is found in illuminations and geographical features and thus, had more aesthetic than climatic motivations. Therefore it can be argued that the structure of the Hereford map does not lend itself to the categorisation of the world according to scientific attitudes towards race in comparison to Macrobian maps. Instead, the Hereford map's structure demonstrates the authority of antiquity and biblical interpretations of race. Indeed, the impact of Roman legacy is evident in the inclusion of the marvellous people within the Ecumene because it reflects St. Augustine's argument that all men 'however strange he may appear' could convert to

[42] Westrem, *The Hereford Map*, p. 375.
[43] Marcia Kupfer, 'The Rhetoric of World Maps in late Antiquity and the Middle Ages', in Marcia Kupfer, Adam S. Cohen and J. H. Chajes (eds.), *The visualisation of knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Turnhout, 2020),p. 269.
[44] Kupfer, 'The Rhetoric of World Maps', p. 277.

Christianity.[45] Thus, the structure of the map demonstrates elements of Roman attitudes towards racial tolerance. The map's structure also highlights a Noachide interpretation of race whereby each of Noah's sons received a section of the world (Japeth-Europe, Shem-Asia, and Ham-Africa) and were the progenitors of those races. Therefore, the evidence of both biblical and more tolerant ancient attitudes towards race emphasises the palimpsetic structure of the Hereford map.

However, the absence of additional pigmentation on the map's peoples significantly deviates from the contemporary Psalter map and therefore, suggests that medieval attitudes towards epidermal race are less evident on the Hereford map. Indeed, Mittman highlights the peculiarity of the Hereford map's retention of just black outlines of peoples, by convincingly comparing it to marvellous peoples and Christ painted in white on the Psalter map of 1260.[46] This indicates that the Hereford map's absence of extra paint was a deliberate choice given that it had precedence in the thirteenth century and yet, both maps use the same absence or presence of colour in the depiction of Christ and the marvellous peoples. Thus, this similarity challenges the simplicity of using epidermal race as a marker of medieval racial attitudes. Furthermore, the argument that additional colour would have been too expensive due to the sheer size of the 1. 58 m map can be challenged. Indeed, Kupfer's description of the Marian triptych as a 'visual tour de force' complete with almost 'life-size' representations of the Angel Gabriel and the Virgin Mary on the map's case, indicates that expense was not spared for neither the map nor the case.[47] Therefore, if the financial cost of the project did not curb the design of the triptych, why would the production team stint on the use of colour? Furthermore, one potential explanation is highlighted in McCluskey's compelling argument that for Abelard, a pioneering twelfth century scholar, skin colour held 'no moral significance' because it could be classified as an accident, as opposed to a substance, according to his studies of

[45] Friedman, *The Monstrous Race*, p. 91.
[46] Mittman, 'Anti-Race?', pp. 180-181.
[47] Kupfer, 'The Hereford Map (c. 1300)', p. 237.

metaphysics.[48] This indicates that twelfth century intellectuals applied new learning to theories of race and thus, this provides one possible explanation for the Hereford map's absence of colour. However, it must be noted that Abelard often contradicted himself in his letters to Heloise by equating whiteness with beauty and virtue and also there is no evidence that the map's creators were aware of Abelard's scholarship.[49] Despite Abelard's inconsistency, his theory of accidents demonstrates a time of increasing interest in scientific theories of race and thus, this highlights the peculiarity of the absence of extra colour on the depiction of peoples on the Hereford map.

Moreover, the ascendance of the concept of 'whiteness' and 'blackness' with regard to skin colour in the thirteenth century suggests that the Hereford map does not reflect epidermal-centric medieval attitudes and instead best demonstrates embodied race such as religion. The thirteenth century focus on epidermal race is demonstrated in two examples. Indeed, Caviness claims that by 1250 Latin Christian art transitioned away from more natural skin tones and towards portraying Latin Christians as white or even colourless.[50] This shift is exemplified by the illustration of bathers in late thirteenth century Italian medical manuscripts as pure white as opposed to the fleshier tones in earlier manuscripts.[51] This indicates that irrespective of biblical connotations, racial attitudes were pervasive in learned medical texts to the extent that it challenged established medical knowledge that associated illness with whiteness. [52] Therefore, the prominence of 'whiteness' in both the medical manuscripts and in the Psalter map indicates that the Hereford map did not reflect contemporary attitudes toward epidermal depiction of race. On the opposite side, Heng argues that the thirteenth century could be defined as a transitional period whereby after, images of 'Blackness' became increasingly common.[53] Indeed, the thirteenth century statute of St. Maurice in Magdeburg

[48] Colleen McCluskey, 'Black on the Outside, White on the Inside: Peter Abelard's use of race', *Critical Philosophy of Race*, 6:2 (2018), p. 142.
[49] McCluskey, 'Black on the Outside, White on the Inside', p. 143.
[50] Madeline Caviness, ' From the Self-Invention of the Whiteman in the Thirteenth Century to The Good, The Bad, and The Ugly', *Different Visions: A Journal of New Perspectives on Medieval Art,* 1 (2008), pp. 17-22.
[51] Caviness, ' From the Self-Invention of the Whiteman', p. 17.
[52] Caviness, ' From the Self-Invention of the Whiteman', p. 17.
[53] Heng, *The Invention of Race*, p. 190.

Cathedral demonstrates an important deviation from contemporary pejorative portrayals of Black Africans and significantly challenges climatic determinism of African 'cowardes' through his portrayal as both a knight and Christian martyr.[54] Therefore, despite St. Maurice's uniqueness, his statue highlights the visibility of epidermal race that is questionably lacking in the Hereford world map. Overall, whilst it it must be noted that medieval people viewed colour more as a spectrum rather than a black and white binary, the absence of painted people in a period of increased epidermal-centric attitudes, indicates that the Hereford map relied on other tools to depict race.

The absence of any link between epidermal race and morality on the Hereford world map highlights its disengagement with theological differentiation methods. Indeed, Patton successfully argues that the concept of 'Blackness' wasn't linked to culture as a 'racial marker', but had connotations with sin and servitude.[55] This indicates that the concept of white virtue was seen as normative and therefore, it is surprising that the map's depiction of the damned in the Last Judgement scene did not include epidermal markers. Furthermore, the correlation between 'blackness' and sin is further supported by Weeda's argument that physical diversity was an outward expression of internal sin and thus, this significantly indicates that skin colour was theoretically mutable if they converted to Christianity.[56] However, Heng highlights the limitations of this correlation between dark skin and sin through the Christian belief in figures such as Prester John who was alleged to preside over a Christian Kingdom in India.[57] The Hereford map further challenges this assumption through one legend that describes Nubians as 'extremely devout Christian Ethiopians' and this indicates that true Christianity could exist regardless of skin colour.[58] Interestingly, this focus on Christianity outside medieval 'Europe'

---

[54] Bartholomaeus Anglicus, *De proprietatibus rerum* (Frankfurt, 1601) translated in Suzanne Conklin Akbari, *Idols in the East: European Representations of Islam and the Orient, 1100-1450*, (Ithaca, 2009), pp. 144-145; Heng, *The Invention of Race*, p. 223.

[55] Pamela A. Patton,' Blackness, Whiteness and the Idea of Race in the Medieval Period', in Andrew Albin, Mary C. Erler, Thomas O'Donnel, Nicholas L. Paul, Nina Rowe, (eds.), Whose Middle Ages?: Teachable moments for an ill-used past (New York, 2019), p. 163.

[56] Weeda, ' The Fixed and the Fluent', p. 101; Asa Simon Mittman, 'Laidlaw Research Project-Race and the Hereford map,' interviewed by Eva Macdonald, July 27 2021, audio, 7:18.

[57] Heng, The Invention of Race, p. 218.

[58] Westrem, The Hereford Map, p. 93.

supports Mittman's argument that Latin Christendom was not as much a place but a way of life.[59] This legend indicates that whilst the Hereford map interacted with theories of place and morality, it used colour for aesthetic and geographic purposes and not to demarcate difference. Therefore, the Hereford map does not represent Latin Christian epidermal-centric attitudes.

To conclude, this essay has argued that thirteenth century Latin Christian attitudes towards race are evident on the Hereford map to a greater extent through embodied representations and less evident in its portrayal of epidermal race. The derogatory comparison between St. Augustine and the Jewish idol worshippers in prayer best demonstrates the prevalence of embodied race on the map because the disparity indicates Latin Christendom's hierarchical attitudes towards religious ethno-racial identities. Evidence that contemporary scepticism concerning Jewish conversion was shared among Hereford's clerical elite indicates the maintenance of a racial hierarchy on both a localised and Latin Christendom-wide scale. Furthermore, the coalescence of Judaism and monstrosity on the Hereford map portrays a dehumanising attitude towards Latin Christendom's Jews and thus indicates the manipulation of monstrosity to further justify Edward's 1290 expulsion of the Jews. Whilst the T-O structure of the map restricts its suitability to illustrate climatic racial attitudes, the Hereford map's depiction of Europe's dense urbanisation and the potential climatic associations of Gog and Magog's habitat highlight traces of medieval scientific attitudes towards race. Therefore, this indicates the palimpsetic nature of the Hereford map because it layers biblical, ancient, scientific and secular authority in its iconography. By contrast, the absence of additional pigmentation on the map's peoples in a period marked by the increased visibility of the concept of 'whiteness' and its links to morality, highlights the map's deviation from contemporary practices. Indeed, the map's apparent disregard for contemporary epidermal-centric attitudes suggests that there was a conscious decision to use other mechanisms to highlight medieval attitudes on race. However, this still leaves the question: why did the Hereford map not paint in its peoples? Was it a politically motivated act or did Abelard's metaphysics still hold sway over a century later? Overall, the Hereford World map best

[59] Mittman, *Cartographies of Exclusion*.

demonstrates embodied representations of race through potential references to contemporary Jewish oppression and is less suited to epidermal race due to its deviation from Latin Christian moralising attitudes towards skin colour.

Bibliography

Akbari, Suzanne Conklin, *Idols in the East: European Representations of Islam and the Orient*, *1100-1450* (Ithaca, 2009)

Austin, Greta, 'Marvellous Peoples or Marvellous Races?: Race and the Anglo-Saxon Wonders of the East', in Jones, Timothy S. and Sprunger, David A (eds.), *Marvels, monsters, and miracles : studies in the medieval and early modern imaginations (*Michigan, 2002), pp. 25-51

Bartlett, Robert,'Medieval and Modern concepts of Race and Ethnicity', *Journal of medieval and Early modern studies*, 31:1 (2001), pp. 39-56.

Bartlett, Robert, 'Illustrating ethnicity in the Middle Ages,' in Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac and Joseph Ziegler (eds.), *The origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 130-156.

Bartlett, Robert, *Natural and the Supernatural in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 2008)

Bartlett, Robert, *The Making of Europe: Conquest, colonisation and cultural exchange 950-1350* (London, 1993)

Biller, Peter, ' The Black in Medieval Science: What Significance?', Proceedings of the Fifth Annual Gilder Lehrman Center International Conference at Yale University, Collective Degradation: Slavery and the Construction of Race, November 7-8, 2003, https://www.medievalists.net/2012/07/the-black-in-medieval-science-what-significance/ (last accessed 21 August 2021)

Biller, Peter, 'Proto-racial thought in Medieval Science,' in Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac and Joseph Ziegler (eds.), *The origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 157-180.

Biller, Peter, 'Views of Jews from Paris around 1300: Christian or 'Scientific', *Studies in Church History,* 29 (1992), pp. 187-207.

Braude, Benjamin,' The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographical Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods', *The William and Mary Quarterly,* 54:1 (1997), pp. 103-142.

Caviness, Madeline, ' From the Self-Invention of the Whiteman in the Thirteenth Century to The Good, The Bad, and The Ugly', *Different Visions: A Journal of New Perspectives on Medieval Art,* 1 (2008), pp. 1-33.

Cohen, Jeffrey Jerome, 'On Saracen Enjoyment: Some Fantasies of Race in late medieval France and England,' *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 31:1 (2001), p. 113-146.

De Miramon, Charles, 'Noble dogs, noble blood: the invention of the concept of race in the Middle Ages,' in Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac and Joseph Ziegler (eds.), *The origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 200-216.

De Wesselow, Thomas, ' Locating the Hereford Mappamundi', *Imago Mundi*, 65:2 (2013), pp. 180-206.

Friedman, John, *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought* (New York, 2000)

Heng, Geraldine, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 2018)

Kim, Dorothy, ' Introduction to literature compass special cluster: Critical race and the Middle Ages', *Literature Compass*, 16:9 (2019), pp. 1-16.

Kishimoto, Kyoko, 'Anti-Racist Pedagogy: From Faculty's Self-Reflection to Organizing Within and Beyond the Classroom', *Race Ethnicity and Education,* 21:4 (2018), pp. 540–554.

Kupfer, Marcia 'The Rhetoric of World Maps in late Antiquity and the Middle Ages', in Marcia Kupfer, Adam S. Cohen and J. H. Chajes (eds.), *The visualisation of knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Turnhout, 2020), pp. 259-290.

Kupfer, Marcia, ' The Jerusalem Effect: Rethinking the Centre in Medieval World Maps', in Bianca Kühnel, Galit Noga-Banai, and Hanna Vorholt (eds.), *Visual Constructs of Jerusalem* (Turnhout, 2014), pp. 353-365.

Kupfer, Marcia, 'The Hereford Map (c. 1300)', in Dan Terkla and Nick Mellea (eds.), *A Companion to English Mappaemundi of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries* (Woodbridge, 2019), pp. 227-252.

McCluskey, Colleen 'Black on the Outside, White on the Inside: Peter Abelard's use of race', *Critical Philosophy of Race*, 6:2 (2018), pp. 135-163.

Mittman, Asa Simon, "Anti-Race? The Need for Colour-Sightedness in Medieval and Renaissance Studies," in Kim Coles and Dorothy Kim (eds.), *A Cultural History of Race in the Renaissance and Early Modern Age* (London, forthcoming 2021)

Mittman, Asa Simon, 'Are the 'monstrous races' races?', P*ostmedieval: A Journal of Medieval Cultural Studies*, 6 (2015), pp. 36-51.

Mittman, Asa Simon, *Cartographies of Exclusion: Christian Mapping of Jews in the age of the English Expulsion* (unpublished book draft on file with author)

Mittman, Asa Simon, *Maps and Monsters in Medieval England* (New York, 2006)

Parfitt, Tudor, 'The construction of Jewish identities in Africa', in Tudor Parfitt and Emanuela Trevisan Semi (eds.), *Jews of Ethiopia: The Birth of an Elite* (New York, 2005), pp. 1-42.

Patton, Pamela A., ' Blackness, Whiteness and the Idea of Race in the Medieval Period', in Andrew Albin, Mary C. Erler, Thomas O'Donnel, Nicholas L. Paul, Nina Rowe, (eds.), *Whose Middle Ages?: Teachable moments for an ill-used past* (New York, 2019), pp. 154-165.

Strickland, Debra Higgs, 'Monstrosity and Race in the Late Middle Ages', in Asa Simon Mittman and Peter Dendle (eds.), *The Ashgate Research Companion to Monsters and the Monstrous,* (London, 2017), p. 365-386.

Strickland, Debra Higgs, ' Otherness on the Hereford Map' Fifteenth Annual International Conference of Iconographic Studies, University of Rijeka, 10 June 2021

Strickland, Debra Higgs, 'Edward I, Exodus, and England on the Hereford World Map', *Speculum*, 93:2 (2018), p. 420-429.

Strickland, Debra Higgs, *Saracens, Demons and Jews: Making Monsters in medieval Art* (Princeton, 2003)

Von den Brinken, Anna-Dorothee,' Jerusalem on the Medieval Mappaemundi: a site both historical and eschatological', in P. D. A. Harvey (ed.) *The Hereford World Map: Medieval World Maps and their context* (London, 2006), pp. 355-380.

Weeda, Claire 'The Fixed and the Fluent: Geographical determinism, ethnicity and religion c. 1100–1300', in Rebecca Futo Kennedy and and Molly Jones-Lewis (eds.), *The Routledge Handbook of Identity and the Environment in the Classical and Medieval World* (London, 2016), pp. 93-113.

Weeda, Claire, 'Ethnic Identification and Stereotypes in Western Europe, circa 1100–1300', *History Compass*, 12:7 (2014), pp. 586-606.

Westrem, Scott, *The Hereford Map: A transcription and translation of the legends with commentary* (Turnhout, 2001)

Ziegler, Joseph, 'Physiognomy, science and proto-racism 1200-1500,' in Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac and Joseph Ziegler (eds.), *The origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 181-199.

Ziegler, Joseph, review of *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* by Geraldine Heng, Speculum, 95:2 (2020), pp. 569-572.